

The Importance of Improving the Nutritional Quality of Packed Lunches in U.S. Schools

Sarah Misyak, PhD; Alisha Farris, PhD, RD; Georgianna Mann, MS; Elena Serrano, PhD

ABSTRACT

Schools represent an ideal venue to influence dietary habits of large numbers of children. While the National School Lunch Program (NSLP) is mandated to meet clear nutrition standards for calories, whole grains, fruits, vegetables, milk, sodium, fat, and saturated fat, there are no nutritional requirements for packed lunches. This Current Issue provides a brief background on the NSLP and research on packed lunches in U.S. schools and internationally in the context of the childhood overweight and obesity epidemic. More research is needed to understand child and parent motivations for bringing packed lunches instead of participating in the NSLP and decision making around which foods items are included. A multidimensional approach is needed to improve the nutritional quality of lunches consumed at schools. School health professionals in partnership with school administrators can play a critical role in strengthening school wellness policies and implementing nutrition education initiatives for children and parents.

Keywords: packed lunch, National School Lunch Program, Healthy Hunger-Free Kids Act

INTRODUCTION

Dietary factors associated with childhood obesity include consuming sugar-sweetened beverages (SSBs) and maintaining a high energy and fat, low fiber diet. SSB consumption has increased across youth of all ages (Wang, Bleich, & Gortmaker, 2008), and nearly 40% of total energy consumed by children and adolescents is in the form of solid fats and added sugars (SoFAS) (Reedy & Krebs-Smith, 2010).

Fruit and vegetable intake for children are below recommended levels, decreasing with age (Faith, Dennison, Edmunds, & Stratton, 2006; Guenther, Dood, Reedy, & Krebs-Smith, 2006; Lorson, Melgar-Quinonex, & Taylor, 2009; Mannino, Lee, Mitchell, Smiciklas-Wright, & Birch, 2004). Additionally, only 30% of children ages two and older consume the recommended amount of dairy and a mere 15-20% of children and adolescents consume recommended levels of whole grains (Briefel & Johnson, 2004; Lee, 2011).

With over 50 million children attending public elementary and secondary schools in the United States daily, schools are an ideal venue to positively influence dietary habits of large numbers of children (Crawford, Gosliner, & Kayman, 2011; Johnson, Bednar, Kwon, & Gustof, 2010; Lee, 2011).

NSLP

Roughly 95% of public schools, and some private schools, participate in the National School Lunch Program (NSLP) (U.S. Department of Agriculture [USDA], Food and Nutrition Service [FNS], 2012). NSLP nutrition standards are updated periodically based on emerging nutrition

science. The 2010 Healthy, Hunger-Free Kids Act (HHFKA) made significant changes to school meal patterns and nutrition requirements (Healthy, Hunger-Free Kids Act, 2010).

The revised standards require schools to increase fruits, vegetables, whole grains, and fat-free and low-fat fluid milk availability; reduce sodium, saturated fat and trans fat levels; and meet the nutrition needs of school children within their calorie requirements (Institute of Medicine, 2007; USDA-FNS, 2012). The changes to school meals were intended to improve school-aged children's diet quality and health while curbing childhood obesity levels (USDA- FNS, 2012).

Packed Lunches

While the HHFKA is designed to improve the school food environment, relatively few efforts focus on the nutritional quality of packed lunches. Overall, existing research suggests packed lunches are of lower nutritional quality than those offered in the NSLP. Packed lunches are less likely to have fruits, vegetables, and dairy and are higher in fat, saturated fat, sodium and sugar than school lunches (Emmons, 1972; Johnson et al., 2010; Johnson & Jensen, 1984; Melnik, Rhoades, Wales, Cowell, & Wolfe, 1998; Pearce, Harper, Haroun, Wood, & Nelson, 2011; Perry, 1984; Rees, Richards, & Gregory, 2008; Rogers, Ness, Hebditch, Jones, & Emmett, 2007; Stevens & Nelson, 2011; Stevens, Nicholas, Wood, & Nelson, 2013; Wolfe & Campbell, 1993).

Three recent U.S. studies have shown packed lunches to have lower nutritional quality than NSLP lunches. A 2011 analysis of over 600 lunches of elementary school children in six Eastern Massachusetts public school districts showed that only 27% of packed lunches met at least three of five NSLP standards (Hubbard, Must, Eliasziw, Folta, & Goldberg, 2014). Also in 2011, an observational study conducted in 12 schools in Texas with intermediate and elementary students found that packed lunches contained more sodium, fewer fruits, vegetables, whole grains and milk (Caruso & Cullen, 2014). Most recently, a 2012 observational study analyzed the packed lunches of over 550 pre-kindergarten and kindergarten children in rural Virginia and found that 61% of packed lunches contained a dessert item, and 40% contained a sugar-sweetened beverage, while NSLP lunches contained no dessert or sugar-sweetened beverage items. The NSLP lunches also contained more sodium, fruits, vegetables, and dairy (Farris et al., 2014). The literature suggests packed lunches may contribute to poor dietary quality and higher risk of childhood obesity (Drewnowski & Bellisle, 2007; Emmons et al., 1972; Hubbard et al., 2014; Johnson, Mander, Jones, Emmett, & Jebb, 2008; Johnson & Jensen, 1984; Johnston, Moreno, El-Mubasher, & Woehner, 2012; Kant, 2003; Melnik et al., 1998; Perry, 1984; Rees et al., 2008; Rogers et al., 2007; Stevens et al., 2013; Vartanian, Schwartz, & Brownell, 2007; Wolfe & Campbell, 1993).

Child taste preferences, cost, food allergies, limited menu options, lunch service capacity, time allotted for eating (i.e., not wanting to wait in long lines to receive a meal), parents desire to provide lunch for their children, or the perception that packed lunches are of a better nutritional quality than school meals may influence the decision to bring a packed lunch from home (Griffin & Barker; 2008; Johnson et al., 2010; Nelson, 2011). A perceived social stigma for free or reduced-price lunch program participation may impact some students decision whether to pack lunch or participate in the NSLP or School Breakfast Program (Bhatia, Jones, & Reicker, 2011; Freeman, Macias, Narayna, Ng, & Yang, 2012). Efforts to reduce this stigma should be considered. For example, free school meals were provided to all six and seven year-olds in England beginning in September 2014 (Naughton, 2014). In the U.S., as publicized by Let's Move!, the Community Eligibility Provision of the HHFKA allows for 22,000 schools serving

primarily low-income students to provide universal school lunch (USDA Office of Communications, 2014). Universal school lunch may also increase NSLP participation by reducing the burden on individual households and schools applying for free and reduced-priced lunch programs. Additional research is needed to determine the relationship between perceived social stigma and participation rates (Bailey-Davis et al., 2013; USDA Food and Nutrition Service, 2012).

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR RESEARCH AND PRACTICE

Numerous studies have called for increased attention to and interventions to improve the nutritional quality of packed lunches (Evans, Greenwood, Thomas, Cleghorn, Kitchmen, & Cade, 2010; Johnston et al., 2012; Ohri-Vacahspati, 2014; Pearce, et al., 2011; Prynne et al., 2011; Rees et al., 2008; Rogers et al., 2007; Stevens & Nelson, 2011; Sweitzer et al., 2011). Parents reported lack of knowledge as a barrier for identifying healthy food options and a desire for handouts, recipes, interactions with other parents, workshops and support for packing healthy lunches (Burgess-Champoux, Marquart, Vickers, & Reicks, 2006; Sweitzer et al., 2011).

Very few interventions have attempted to increase the nutritional quality of packed lunches. Evans et al. (2010) found moderate increases in fruit and vegetable consumption, decreases in savory snacks in packed lunches, but little improvement in nutrient profile by providing 8 to 9 year-old children in the U.K. with lunch boxes, bags and educational materials (Evans et al., 2010). Sweitzer et al. (2010) implemented an education-based intervention for parent and pre-school-aged child dyads which also included teacher training. The intervention group increased vegetables and whole grain servings but not fruit offered in preschool children's packed lunches (Sweitzer, et al., 2010). Bell et al. (2014) had considerable success introducing a program to support healthy eating in 240 Australian center-based child care services (Bell et al., 2014). The research team provided staff training, support, monitoring and feedback with incentives to implement the program. Intervention sites were more likely to engage parents in nutrition programming, set policies on packed foods, and comply with healthy eating guidelines than non-intervention sites (Sweitzer et al., 2011).

School wellness policies provide an opportunity for engaging in collaboration between the home and school environment to support the adoption of healthful behaviors (Story, Kaphingst, Robinson-O'Brien, & Glanz, 2008). Collaborating with parents in decision-making allows for buy-in and lessens the negative effects of implementing food policy changes (Perlman et al., 2012). Additionally, schools are encouraged to involve parents and students as key stakeholders in ensuring a healthy school environment (USDA-FNS, 2012), and parents have previously shown interest in partnering with schools to improve lunches (Sweitzer et al., 2011).

The regulation of food items in packed lunches is not currently embraced in the U.S., but there are precedents in other countries for such regulations. Overseas, parents tend to support potential policies to improve the quality of meals (Pettigrew, Pescud, & Donovan, 2012; Van Asnem, Schrijvers, Rodenburg, Schuit, & van de Mheen, 2013). Examples include nutrition policy on home-packed foods at Australian center-based child care services, mandatory vegetarian days to promote sustainability in Helsinki schools, and junk food-free days in Canadian schools (Bell et al., 2014; Lombardini & Lankoski, 2013; Browning, Laxer, & Janssen, 2013).

School health professionals can help design evidence-based, parent-focused programs, emphasizing the contribution and importance of meals in meeting daily dietary guidelines and promoting optimal learning. Providing parents with simple, cost-effective strategies to improve the dietary quality of packed lunches while balancing children's taste preferences is warranted. Future work to influence the nutritional quality of both packed and NSLP lunches, should include 1) further research on determining who drives decision making for packed lunches and what factors motivate food choices (such as cost, convenience, peer influence, food preferences, etc.), 2) research on the impact of the HHFKA standards on food choices and parent perception and acceptance of regulations, 3) campaigns and/or interventions to encourage participation in the NSLP, 4) nutrition interventions to encourage the inclusion of healthier food items in packed lunches, and 5) incorporating goals related to the quality of packed lunches into school wellness policies along with parent acceptance of such goals or policies.

REFERENCES

Bailey-Davis, L., Virus, A., McCoy, T.A., Wojtanowski, A., Vander Veur, S.S., & Foster, G.D. (2013). Middle school student and parent perceptions of government-sponsored free school breakfast and consumption: A qualitative inquiry in an urban setting. *Journal of the Academy of Nutrition & Dietetics*, 113(2), 251-257. doi:0.1016/j.jand.2012.09.017

Bell, A.C., Davies, L., Finch, M., Wolfenden, L., Francis, J.L., Sutherland, R., & Wiggers, J. (2014). An implementation intervention to encourage healthy eating in centre-based child-care services: Impact of the Good for Kids Good for Life programme. *Public Health Nutrition*, 9, 1-10. doi:10.1017/S1368980013003364

Bhatia, R., Jones, P., & Reicker, Z. (2011). Competitive foods, discrimination, and participation in the National School Lunch Program. *American Journal of Public Health*, 101(8),1380-1386. doi:10.2105/AJPH.2011.300134

Briefel, R.R., & Johnson, C.L.(2004). Secular trends in dietary intake in the United States. *Annual Review of Nutrition*, 24, 401-431.

Browning, F.H., Laxer, R.E., & Janssen, I. (2013). Food and eating environments in Canadian schools. *Canadian Journal of Dietetic Practice & Research*, 74, 160-166.

Burgess-Champoux, T., Marquart, L., Vickers, Z., & Reicks, M. (2006). Perceptions of children, parents, and teachers regarding whole-grain foods, and implications for a school-based intervention. *Journal of Nutrition Education & Behavior*, 38(4), 230–237.

Carruso M., & Cullen K. (2014). Quality and cost of student lunches brought from home. *Journal of the American Medical Association*, 169(1), 86-90. doi:10.1001/jamapediatrics.2014.2220.

Crawford, P.B., Gosliner, W., & Kayman, H. (2011). The ethical basis for promoting nutritional health in public schools in the United States. *Preventing Chronic Disease*, 8(5), A98.

Drewnowski, A., & Bellisle, F. (2007). Liquid calories, sugar, and body weight. *The American Journal of Clinical Nutrition*, 85(3), 651-661.

Emmons, L. (1972). A study of school feeding programs: I. economic eligibility and nutritional need. *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 61(3), 262-268.

Evans, C.E., Greenwood, D.C., Thomas, J.D., Cleghorn, C.L., Kitchmen, M.S., & Cade, J.E. (2010). SMART lunch box intervention to improve the food and nutrient content of children's packed lunches: UK wide cluster randomised controlled trial. *Journal of Epidemiology & Community Health*, 64(11), 970-976. doi:10.1136/jech.2008.085837

Faith, M.S., Dennison, B.A., Edmunds, L.S., & Stratton, H.H. (2006). Fruit juice intake predicts increased adiposity gain in children from low-income families: Weight status-by-environment interaction. *Pediatrics*, 188(5), 2066-2075.

Farris A.R., Misyak S., Duffey K.J., Davis G.C., Hosig K., Atzaba-Poria, N., ... Serrano E.L. (2014). Nutritional comparison of packed and school lunches in pre-kindergarten and kindergarten children following the implementation of the 2012-2013 National School Lunch Program Standards. *Journal of Nutrition Education & Behavior*, 46, 621-626. doi:10.1016/j.jneb.2014.07.007

Freeman, D., Macias, A., Narayan, A., Ng, R., & Yang, L. (2012). Under-enrollment and under-participation in Vermont's school lunch program: An analysis of causes and solutions. Hanover, NH: The Nelson A. Rockefeller Center Policy Research Shop.

Griffin, T.L., & Barker, M.E. (2008). Packed lunches for primary-school children: A qualitative study of parents' views. *Proceedings of the Nutrition Society* 67, E218.

Guenther, P.M., Dodd, K.W., Reedy, J., & Krebs-Smith, S.M. (2006). Most Americans eat much less than recommended amounts of fruits and vegetables. *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 106(9): 1371-1379.

Healthy, Hunger-Free Kids Act of 2010, 42 U.S.C. § 1751 et seq. (2010).

Hubbard, K.L., Must, A., Eliasziw, M., Folta, S.C., & Goldberg, J. (2014). What's in children's backpacks: Foods brought from home. *Journal of the Academy of Nutrition & Dietetics*, 114(9), 1424-1431. doi:10.1016/j.jand.2014.05.010

Institute of Medicine, Food and Nutrition Board, Committee on Nutrition Standards for Foods in Schools. (2007). *Nutrition standards for foods in schools: Leading the way toward healthier youth*. Washington, DC: National Academies Press.

Johnson, C.M., Bednar, C., Kwon, J., & Gustof, A. (2010). Comparison of nutrient content and cost of home-packed lunches to reimbursable school lunch nutrient standards and prices. *Journal of Child Nutrition & Management*, 33, 1-8. Retrieved from <https://www.schoolnutrition.org/JCNM/>

Johnson, W.A., & Jensen, J.R. (1984). Influence of noon meal on nutrient intakes and meal patterns of selected fifth-grade children. *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 84(8), 919.

Johnson, L., Mander, A.P., Jones, L.R., Emmett, P.M., & Jebb, S.A. (2008). Energy-dense, low-fiber, high-fat dietary pattern is associated with increased fatness in childhood. *American Journal of Clinical Nutrition*, 87(4), 846-854.

Johnston, C.A., Moreno, J.P., El-Mubasher, A., & Woehler, D. (2012). School lunches and lunches brought from home: A comparative analysis. *Childhood Obesity*, 8(4), 364-368. doi:10.1089/chi.2012.0012

Kant, A.K. (2003). Reported consumption of low-nutrient-density foods by American children and adolescents: Nutritional and health correlates, NHANES III, 1988 to 1994. *The Journal of the American Medical Association Pediatrics*, 157, 789-796.

Lee, S.M. (2011). *School health guidelines to promote healthy eating and physical activity*. Atlanta, GA. National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Division of Adolescent and School Health.

Lombardini, C., & Lankoski, L. (2013). Forced choice restriction in promoting sustainable food consumption: Intended and unintended effects of the mandatory vegetarian day in Helsinki schools. *Journal of Consumer Policy*, 36, 159-178. doi:10.1007/s10603-013-9221-5

Lorson, B.A., Melgar-Quinonex, H.R., & Taylor, C.A. (2009). Correlates of fruit and vegetable intakes in US children. *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 109(3), 474-478. doi:10.1016/j.jada.2008.11.022

Mannino, M.L., Lee, Y., Mitchell, D.C., Smiciklas-Wright, H., & Birch, L.L. (2004). The quality of girls' diets declines and tracks across middle childhood. *International Journal of Behavioral Nutrition & Physical Activity*, 1(1), 5.

Melnik, T.A., Rhoades, S.J., Wales, K.R., Cowell, C., & Wolfe, W.S. (1998). Food consumption patterns of elementary school children in New York City. *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 98(2), 159-164.

Naughton, L. (2014). Giving children the best start: Free school meals. *Community Practice*, 87(1), 14-16.

Nelson, M. (2011). *The School Food Trust: Transforming school lunches in England*. London, UK: The British Nutrition Foundation Nutrition Bulletin, 36.

Ohri-Vachaspati, P.L. (2014). Parental perception of the nutritional quality of school meals and its association with students' school lunch participation. *Appetite*, 74, 44-47. doi:10.1016/j.appet.2013.10.024

Pearce, J., Harper, C., Haroun, D., Wood, L., & Nelson, M. (2009). Short communication: Key differences between school lunches and packed lunches in primary schools in England in 2009. *Public Health Nutrition*, 14(8), 1507-1510. doi: 10.1017/S1368980010003605

Perlman SE, Nonas C, Lindstrom LL, Choe-Castillo J, McKie H, Alberti PM. (2012). A menu

for health: Changes to New York City School food, 2001 to 2011. *Journal of School Health*, 82(10), 484-491. doi:10.1111/j.1746-1561.2012.00726.x

Perry, L. (1984). Student Lunch Practices: A comparison of cost and dietary adequacy of school lunch and brown bag lunches. *School Food Service Research Review*, 8(2), 114.

Pettigrew, S., Pescud, M., & Donovan, R.J. (2012). Stakeholder support for school food policy expansions. *Health Education Research*, 27(6), 996-1004. doi:10.1093/her/cys076

Prynne, C.J., Handford, C., Dunn, V., Bamber, D., Goodyer, I.M., & Stephen, A.M. (2011). The quality of midday meals eaten at school by adolescent; School lunches compared with packed lunches and their contribution to total energy and nutrient intakes. *Public Health Nutrition*, 7, 1118-1125. doi:10.1017/S1368980011002205

Reedy, J., & Krebs-Smith, S.M. (2010). Dietary sources of energy, solid fats, and added sugars among children and adolescents in the United States. *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 110(10), 1477-1484. doi:10.1016/j.jada.2010.07.010

Rees, G., Richards, C., & Gregory, J. (2008). Food and nutrient intakes of primary school children: A comparison of school meals and packed lunches. *Journal of Human Nutrition and Dietetics*, 21(5), 420-427. doi:10.1111/j.1365-277X.2008.00885.x

Rogers, I.S., Ness, A.R., Hebditch, K., Jones, L.R., & Emmett, P.M. (2007). Quality of food eaten in English primary schools: School dinners vs packed lunches. *European Journal of Clinical Nutrition*, 61(7), 856-864.

Institute of Medicine. (2009). *School meals: Building blocks for healthy children*. Washington, DC: National Academies Press.

Stevens, L., & Nelson, M. (2011). The contribution of school meals and packed lunch to food consumption and nutrient intakes in UK primary school children from a low income population. *Journal of Human Nutrition & Dietetics*, 24(3), 223-232. doi:10.1111/j.1365-277X.2010.01148.x

Stevens, L., Nicholas, J., Wood, L., & Nelson, M. (2013). School lunches v. packed lunches: A comparison of secondary schools in England following the introduction of compulsory school food standards. *Public Health Nutrition*, 16(6), 1037-42. doi:10.1017/S1368980013000852

Story, M., Kaphingst, K.M., Robinson-O'Brien, R., & Glanz, K. (2008). Creating healthy food and eating environments: Policy and environmental approaches. *The Annual Review of Public Health*, 29, 253-272.

Sweitzer, S.J., Briley, M.E., Roberts-Gray, C., Hoelscher, D.M., Harrist, R.B., Staskel, D.M., & Almansour, F.D. (2010). Lunch is in the bag: Increasing fruits, vegetables, and whole grains in sack lunches of preschool-aged children. *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 110(7), 1058-1064. doi:10.1016/j.jada.2010.04.010

Sweitzer, S.J., Briley, M.E., Roberts-Gray, C., Hoelscher, D.M., Staskel, D.M., & Almansour,

F.D. (2011). How to help parents pack better preschool sack lunches: Advice from parents for educators. *Journal of Nutrition Education & Behavior*, 43(3), 194-8. doi:10.1016/j.jneb.2010.09.002

U.S. Department of Agriculture. (2014). *National School Lunch Program*. Retrieved from <http://www.fns.usda.gov/slp>

U.S. Department of Agriculture Food and Nutrition Service. (2012). *Nutrition standards in the National School Lunch and School Breakfast Program, Final Rule*. Washington, DC: *Federal Register*.

U.S. Department of Agriculture. (2014). *The White House and USDA announce school wellness standards*. Washington, DC: USDA Office of Communications Press Release 0029.14.

Van Asnem, W.J., Schrijvers, C.T., Rodenburg, G., Schuit, A.J., & van de Mheen, D. (2013). School food policy at Dutch primary schools: Room for improvement? Cross-sectional findings from the INPACT study. *BMC Public Health*, 13, 339. doi:10.1186/1471-2458-13-339

Vartanian, L.R., Schwartz, M.B., & Brownell, K.D. (2007). Effects of soft drink consumption on nutrition and health: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *American Journal of Public Health*, 97(4), 667-675.

Wang, Y.C., Bleich, S.N., & Gortmaker, S.L. (2008). Increasing caloric contribution from sugar-sweetened beverages and 100% fruit juices among US children and adolescents, 1988–2004. *Pediatrics*, 121(6), 1604-1614. doi:10.1542/peds

Wolfe, W.S., & Campbell, C.C. (1993). Food pattern, diet quality, and related characteristics of schoolchildren in New York State. *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 93(11), 1280-1284.

BIOGRAPHY

Misyak, Farris, Mann, and Serrano are respectively Community Nutrition Associate, graduate student, graduate student, and Associate Professor in the Department of Human Nutrition, Foods, and Exercise at Virginia Tech University in Blacksburg, Virginia..